[Prof. Chandresh P. Thakur]

been attacked. So, she is the person who gets the precedence. Yes, Mrs. Beniwal... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, I respect your ruling. But I want to know one thing. Some things were said about me... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Those things will not go on record. They are being expunged... (*Interruptions*)...Please sit down. That matter is finished now... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: What is being expunged, Sir? ...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Yes, Mrs. Beniwal now... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, when I wanted to come to the front bench and speak, I was not allowed. But now you are allowing her to come to the front seat ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, what is this? Mrs. Jayanthi Natarajan was not allowed to speak from there and now you are allowing some other Member ...(*Interruptions*)... You were not allowing one Member then and you are allowing another now... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Sir, I was asking for your permission to come to the front bench and speak. Now, I am asking for your permission to come and sit here... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Yes, with permission you can come and speak from here... (*Interruptions*)...

Yes. Mrs. Beniwal.

SPECIAL MENTIONS

Alleged attack on Smt. Vidya Beniwal Member, Rajya Sabha

श्रीमती विद्या बेनीवाल (हरियाणा): भजन लाल जी द्वारा पूरा परिवार खत्म कराने की कोशिश हो रही है । इसके लिए कोई प्रबंध कर दें । वे मुल्जिम गिरफ्तार भी नहीं हुए हैं । पुलिस मौके पर थी ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चंद्रेश पी० ठाकुर): फिर से कहिए मैडम ।

श्रीमती विद्या बेनीवाल : मेरी जिप्सी पर गोलियां चलीं । जिप्सी छलनी हो गयी । बाल बाल बची हूं । 7 बज का टाइम था ।

एक माननीय सदस्य : किस तारीख को ?

श्रीमती विद्या बेनीवाल : 7 तारीख को गरबा गांव में जा रही थी । मेरा घर गांव में भी है और शहर में भी है । भजन लाल जी ने एक गिरोह छोड़ रखा है । सिरसा डिस्ट्रिक्ट में । कांग्रेस की सीट से वह हारा है और हमारा उम्मीदवार जीत गया है इसलिए उसको वह हो रहा है कि इस परिवार को खत्म करो ।

श्रीमती सुषमा स्वराज (हरियाणा) : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदया, ...(**व्यवधान**) मैं इसमें जोड़ना चाह रही हूं... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर): आप बैठिए । वे खुद बोलें । कुछ और बोलना है मैडम ।

Now, Let her speak... (*Interruptions*)...

श्रीमती विद्या बेनीवाल : चार आदमियों का, हत्यारों का नाम लिख दिया है । कोई गिरफ्तार नहीं कर रहा है इनको ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal): Sir, the Home Minister is here and he can react... (*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): I am simply drawing the attention of the Government and the Home Minister here. This is a serious matter and her concern must be looked into... (*Interruptions*)...I would like to have some response from the Minister... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Uttar Pradesh): Protection must be given to her. I will first request the Home Minister.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): I think the Home Minister is responding.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS AND THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): Sir, first of all, I would request the honourable Members to maintain the dignity of the House. On every issue if they are going to rise like this, we cannot conduct any business at all. Is it a free-for-all here? What is it that is going on here now? You have to make distinction... (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Nobody is capable of stating her problem. She has expressed her problems.

इस पर और चर्चा की आवश्यकता नहीं है । मंत्री जी ने स्वयं सुना है । उस पर वे अपनी प्रतिक्रिया दे रहे हैं उसको ध्यान में रखिए ।

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): Sir, I am on a point of order.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): What is your point of order?

SHRI MURLIDHAR CHANDRAKANT BHANDARE (Maharashtra): Sir, you invited the Leader of the House and Home Minister to respond and when he gets up to speak, others are still continuing. Where is the dignity of the House? Can they not wait till Home Minister and Leader of the House finishes his point? Sir, we are as much concerned with her safety as they are.

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर) जब एक सदस्या ने यह सवाल उठाया कि उनकी जान पर खतरा है तो यह एक बहुत गम्भीर समस्या है । जब सदन के सामने यह बात आई तो यह सबके लिए सम्मान की बात है । गृह मंत्री जी इस पर प्रतिक्रिया दे रहे है ।

SHRI ISH DUTT YADAV (Uttar Pradesh): Her husband was murdered and her life is in danger (*Interruptions*)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर): मैं सरकार से अनुरोध करूंगा कि इन सारी बातों की छानबीन की जाए और इस पर उचित कदम बिना विलम्ब लिया जाए । ...(**व्यवधान**)

Now, on the arrest of Mr. Thulasi Reddy. Mr. Padmanabham (*Interruptions*)

SHRI A. G. KULKARNI (Maharashtra): The Leader of the House is responding. Why don't you allow him to respond? Let him speak. (*Interruptions*)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर): उनको सब फैक्ट्स मालूम हैं । ईश दत्त जी आप बैठ जाइये । होम मिनिस्टर कुछ कह रहे हैं । इनकी बात सुन लीजिए ।

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : भजन लाल ने इनके ऊपर हमला करवाया है, यह श्रीमती विद्या बेनीवाल ने लिखित दिया है । इसकी जांच होनी चाहिए । इनको और इनके लड़के की जान को खतरा है । इनके हजबैंड का मर्डर हो चुका है। यह सारी बातें आपकी नॉलेज में होनी चाहिएं ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (प्रो० चन्द्रेश पी० ठाकुर): सारी बातें सरकार के सामने आ चुकी हैं।

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : यह बात क्लियर होने का समय है कि भजन लाल ने इसके ऊपर अटैक करवाया है । इसकी जांच होनी चाहिए ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR) : The hon. Member has brought to my notice that her husbond... (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. Let me clarify for the benefit of the hon. Minister. The hon. Member came and spoke to me that her husband has been killed by the same set of people and there is now a risk to her own, personal life and other members of her family. She is feeling... (*Interruptions*). Don't interrupt. This won't help anybody. She said that she is totally insecure, as also other members of her family. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): Her husband was killed is not a new story; it is an old story. They are bringing the story again ... (*Interruptions*) There is no other motive. The only motive is ... (*Interruptions*) There is the people's Government to Haryana. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): This will not help. I am re-stating what she told me, and it is for the hon. Minister to react.

THE LEADER OF THE HOUSE (SHRI S. B. CHAVAN): I quite understand the anxiety of the Members of the House. I will make enquiries from the State Government and inform the House as to under what circumstances this has been done. It is in fact very serious. One of the hon. Members said that her life is also in danger. If she wants any protection I will also ask the State Government. (*Interruptions*)

Why are you getting up? You are not prepared to listen to anything (*Interruptions*) आप जरा शांति के साथ सुनें। मैं जो आपको कह रहा हूं, उन्हीं के फायदे के लिए बात कह रहा हूं कि आनरेबल मेंबर को अगर जान का खतरा है, ऐसा वह हमें कहती है, तो हम उनको प्रोटैक्शन देने के लिए स्टेट गवर्नमेंट से कहेंगे । हम तो यहां से कोई प्रोटेक्शन उनको नहीं दे सकते । ... (**व्यवधान**) एक सदस्य बात करे... (**व्यवधान**) संजय सिंह जी, आप बात करें । इन सब को बिठाइये ... (**व्यवधान**)

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : भजन लाल ने कातिलाना हमला करवाया ... (**व्यवधान**) मान्यवर, आप सुरक्षा प्रबन्ध कीजिए । ... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Sir, the hon. Member has alleged that she is under threat of life from the people who are in power in Haryana today. Now, if the Home Minister, the Leader of the House says that he is going to ask the same Government to provide protection to her, then where does it take her and us? I am requesting the Home Minister and the Leader of the House to kindly assure all of us that he will provide the protection which is available with the Government of India to the hon. Member.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: I hope the hon. Member, Shri Yashwant Sinha has seriously considered the implications of what he is saying. Once you concede that in matters of State Government's jurisdiction the Central Government can interfere, then it has its own... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: She is a Member of this House.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: When the time comes, certainly we will discuss this aspect of the question. But.... (*Interruptions*)...let me make my position absolutely clear... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA (Bihar): Your Home Ministry can get the matter enquired into....

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: That, of course I am prepared to do.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: My friend should know that she is a Member of Parliament also and she is entitled for protection. Secondly, my friend Mr. Sinha was any saying what is the objection for you to give protection to her as a Member of Parliament.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: There is no objection. The only point is: Who has to provide the protection?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Not the Stote Government.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: If the State Government, in spite of our writing to them that her life is in danger and she needs to be given the security, in spite of that, if the State Government were not to act on it, then we will try to see that they provide security. I cannot possibly do anything more than that. We cannot from the Centre provide the security.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: I only say that there should not be any prevarication or doubt or anything on this. When a Member of Parliament is threatened. I think, it is the duty of the Home Ministry to give all protection.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: Protection will be given not by the Centre. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Just a minute. I am saying this from personal experience. There was a threat to my life during the last elections. And when I reported the matter to the Government of India, I was provided security by the Government of India, by its own forces. They did not depend on the State Government. It is entirely in order for the Government of India to provide protection to a Member of Parliament from the Forces at its disposal irrespective of the State to which the Member belongs. There is absolutely no difficulty, no bar, and it does not interfere with the autonomy of the State Government.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: I think, the hon. Member forgets that when this protection was given, he was a Minister of Government of India. (*Interruptions*) Even that ... (*Interruptions*).

मौलाना अबेदुल्ला खान आजमी (उत्तर प्रदेश) : सिन्हा जी, आप यह भूल रहे हैं कि आप मिनिस्टर थे इसलिए सुरक्षा दी गई । तो क्या मिनिस्टर होने के नाते सुरक्षा दी जाएगी और एम०पी० होने के नाते सुरक्षा नहीं दी जाएगी ?

†[مولانا عبید اللہ خاں اعظمی: سنہا جی آپ یہ بھول رہے ہیں کہ آپ منسٹر تھے اسلئے سرکشا دی گئی - تو کیا منسٹر ہونے کے ناطے سرکشا دی جائیگی اور ایم پی ہونے کے ناطے نہیں دی جائیگی -]

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: You don't make a distinction between a Member of Parliament and a Minister. I plead with you that whether he is a Member of Parliament or a Minister he is entitled for protection. And you have got to give.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: I respect the feelings of the Leader of the Opposition that the Members of the House need to be given protection. If the hon. Leader of the Opposition will see me, I will be able to show him the Acts under which there are certain limitations. There are powers of the State Government. There are powers of the Central Government. And if you are prepared to show me any precedent certainly we will try to accommodate. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: You go by precedents. What is this?

†[Transliteration in Arabic Script.]

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Yes, Mr. Ahluwalia. (*Interruptions*) One after the other, please.

श्री सुरेन्द्रजीत सिंह अहलुवालिया : उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, इस सदन के किसी भी सदस्य को अगर जान का खतरा हो तो उसकी राज्य सरकार जिस राज्य से वह आते है और केन्द्रीय सरकार, दोनों का धर्म बनता है कि उसकी सुरक्षा की व्यवस्था करें पर आज इतने वर्षों के बाद यह ख्याल आया कि एक माननीय सदस्या को जान का खतरा है, यह सोचने का विषय है... (**व्यवधान**)... उपसभाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं अच्छी तरह से जानता हूं कि इनके पति हरियाणा एसेम्बली में एम० एल० ए० थे । उनकी हत्या हुई थी तो हरियाणा में किसकी सरकार थी यह पहले पूछा जाये और उस सरकार ने उनके लिए क्या किया था ? आज फिर कांग्रेस की सरकार को बदनाम करने के लिए यह सारा ढोंग रचा जा रहा है ।

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): You have made your point.

SHRI P. UPENDRA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, the Home Minister must be aware of some precedents. When the Telugu Desam Government was in power in Andhra Pradesh one of the Congress MLAs appealed to the Central Government that he wanted protection from the CRPF because he had no confidence in the State police. And the CRPF was provided to that Vijayawada MLA. In a recent case also, when Mrs. Jayalalitha wanted protection from the Central Government, not only CRPF but NSG was also provided to her.

SHRI S. B. CHAVAN: I will definitely go into all the precedents that you have quoted now and if it is there we will certainly do it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I appreciate what the Home Minister has stated, that there are clear jurisdictions of the State Government and the Central Government about law and order, about security etc. I also appreciate that the Central Government unilaterally taking action on this issue without enquiring or without taking the State Government into confidence will create problems. Centre-State problem and all these problems are there. At the same time a Member of Parliament has been threatened.

Already there has been an attack on her family, no matter during whose time her husband was killed and who was the Chief Minister. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Bring the larger issue. The question of threat to her life is an immediate concern of the House and how to exercise over it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Sir, the question is that the Home Minister has assured us that. (*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Habits die hard.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: ..he will be enquiring into the matter. Previously on the floor of the House. Such incidents were brought to notice. A time-frame was fixed by which the Home Ministry is to report to the House. I would like the Home Minister to collect the information and take the House into confidence at the earliest if not before we adjourn because today the House is adjourned for Monday. Another point, let the State Government be taken into confidence because here the complaint is against the ruling party in that State.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): You are complicating the matter.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Though the person apprehends that she might be attacked, if security was provided to her by the State Government that security cannot protect her. So in that case if the Central Government is convinced, then I will request the Home Minister to provide personal security because providing personal security is a different matter. You have to provide personal security to the MP concerned.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): I hope you realise the implication of your submission.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Let us take up the Cauvery issue.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Sir, I am extremely bewildered ... (*Interruptions*). My point is, the Home Minister should have straightaway said that the Government will be making all efforts to save the life of the hon. Member of the House. Instead of giving such a straight reply and commitment to the House, the hon. Home Minister is taking protection under legal loopholes and legalistic lapses. It is most unfortunate Government should make a straight commitment that everything will be done by the Central Government to protect the life of a Member of the House. If the Member of the House cannot live in peace, if her life is not secure, I do not know to what extent can we expect protection from the Government. I, therefore, appeal to the Home Minister to make a statement and give an assurance to the House that everything will be done to save her life.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): On the question of giving protection to the lady Member, I think all points have been covered. Now any more Members speaking additionally on the same point does not get us any further. The Home Minister has heard: he has also replies. He has not ruled out anything excepting saying that we will go and ascertan the facts. And you will have heard him.

डा० संजय सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मेरा एक प्वाइंट है और वह यह है कि माननीय गृह मंत्री जी ने अभी कहा कि कोई प्रेसिडेन्ट नहीं हैं, जो यहां का सदस्य नहीं है उसको कोई सुरक्षा नहीं दी जाती । श्री मुलायम सिंह यादव ने तो विधान सभा के आज सदस्य है और नही लोकसभा के, लेकिन उनकी सुरक्षा के लिए नेशनल सिक्योरिटी गार्ड के कमांडो लगाए गए हैं । अभी माननीय सदस्या के जीवन पर, उनकी मोटरगाड़ी पर कई फायरिंग हुई कई गोलियां चलीं और इसके पहले इनके पति की हत्या भी हो चुकी है तो सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट को चाहिए कि चाहें वह सीआरपीएफ, चाहे दिल्ली पुलिस से इनकी सुरक्षा की व्यवस्था करें ।

श्री ईश दत्त यादव : उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आप सरकार को डायरेक्ट कर दें कि तुरन्त सुरक्षा की जाए । . . . (**व्यवधान**)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): Now this matter is over. The Home Minister has already replied. There is nothing else left. He has heard everybody. He will take into consideration the points raised by the hon. Members on the question of protection to be given to the hon. Member. It is a primary item and I am sure the Government will apply its mind and take all necessary action. That is all.

Arrest of Dr. N. Thulasi Reddy, Member, Rajya Sabha

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, this is with great anguiush and concern for the life of our hon. Member that I am making this special mention....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (PROF. CHANDRESH P. THAKUR): This is his maiden speech as leader of his party.

SHRI MENTAY PADMANABHAM: Sir, Dr. Thulasi Reddy is one of our Members, and as you are aware, he is an active Member of this House. The State police arrested him on the 4th of this month. He was immediately produced before the Magistrate who sent him for judicial custody on the charge of murder of an independent candidate who was contesting from Cuddaph constituency. The circumstances which led to the counterman-